Women under Representation: Comparative Analysis Between Japan and Indonesia

Nur Azizah *

Abstract

Women under representation is a classic global issue. In Asian countries, which have a strong patriarchal culture, women must face more severe obstacles for increasing their representative in politics. What is more worrisome is that Japan, which is the most developed country in Asia, has a more severe problem, even when compared with Indonesia.

This article aims to compare and elucidate the difficulties which be faced by Japanese and Indonesian women for increasing their under representation in parliament (House of Representative). It was based on research conducted with literature study methods and interviews with related political figures. The analysis will be conducted on three key variables, namely historical, cultural, and political variables in both countries.

I argue that both Japanese and Indonesian women have to face the masculine culture in political parties and unfriendly electoral system, but Indonesian women got a slightly better result on the House of Representative since they have different historical, cultural, and political contexts.

Key words: Women, Under representation, Japan, Indonesia

1. Introduction

Comparing Japanese and Indonesian women in politics are very interesting. Both countries begin their women movement in twentieth century. Although both are located in the Asian region that has a very strong patriarchal system, but both recorded significant progress in placing women in government. Megawati Sukarnoputri became the first Indonesian female president in 2000 – 2004. Under president Joko Widodo, Indonesia has some prominent female ministers such as Retno Marsudi (Minister of Foreign Affairs) and Sri Mulyani (Minister of Finance). Under PM. Shinzo Abe, Japan has Tomomi Inada (Minister of Defense) and Yuriko Koike (Governor of Tokyo).

Women believed that the large number of women’s representation in government and parliament can empower women as policy makers especially related to the production of gender responsive policies. It is because women have a better understanding of women’s problems than men have. That is why “women must presence”! (Phillips, 1995). (Andriana, Siregar, Harris, Yuniarti, & Aisah Putri Budiatri, 2012). But, realizing this is a very difficult thing, especially in Japan and Indonesia. In the last election, women got 17.3 % (97 from 560 in 2014 election) in Indonesia.

*  ムハマディア大学、Muhammadiyah University of Yogyakarta
House of Representatives, and only 9.5% (45 from 475) in Japan House of Representative, although Japan is developed country, and Indonesia is developing country. It is mean that on women representative issues, Japanese and Indonesian women find many similarities of difficulties.

What kind of difficulties which be faced by Japanese and Indonesian women for increasing their representative?

2. Theoretical Framework

For analyzing this issue, we can refer to the speech of the President of Korean National Council of Women (KNCW), Jung-Sook Kim in “The 6th Asia Pacific Congress of Women in Politics (2006)”. Kim mention some difficulties which be faced by women who want to stand for election, as illustrated bellow. (Kim, 2006)

| Women face countless difficulties in their attempt to become legislators |
|---------------------------|--------------------------|
| Problem                   | Reasons                  |
| Dearth of women who wish to take part in politics | • Politics is considered to be men’s realm |
| Patriarchal culture       | • Traditionally women were excluded from high positions |
| Religion                  | • Social division of gender roles legitimized by religious doctrine and practice acted to curb female potential |
| Modern military state     | • Women were excluded from public activities in the military culture |

Illustration 1: Women face countless difficulties in their attempt to become legislator.
Cultural and social structure affects women’s presence in politics. Inglehart and Norris (2003: 11) argue that post-industrial countries usually attain higher gender equality scores than industrial and agrarian countries. Gender equality spurs increases in women’s political influence. Inglehart and Norris (2003: 34–5), however, mark Japan as a peculiar case, noting that ‘all of the postindustrial nations, with the important exception of Japan, are ... most strongly in favour of gender equality’. High levels of economic growth and human development notwithstanding, Japanese attitudes towards gender equality remain underdeveloped. The main reason for this gap is the traditional culture of Japan, which has its origins in Buddhism and Confucian. (Inglehart & Norris, 2003). This argument is supported by Christensen (2008: 229) which mention that the underrepresentation of women in politics is one manifestation of Japan’s social and cultural rigidity. (Christensen, 2008)

3.1 Comparing Japanese and Indonesian Historical Context

1. Japan

At the beginning, the role of Japanese women in social and politic is high. Some ancient Chinese literatures noted Japan as “The Empress Kingdom” since many empress in Japan. Until now Japan has 127 (Hall, 1978).

Japanese women were forced to decrease their involvement in the public sector during the military aristocracy (shogun - samurai) in the 12–19 century and before the World War II. Under Japanese military aristocracy (shogun), battles become the main strategy in politics. Since physically women are not as strong as man, and women can not led the battle, so the women’s political power decline. Japanese long arm conflict caused the withdrawal of the status of women. Their right to life, to get education, was discriminated, and violence againsts women increase.

2. Indonesia

Otherwise, in Indonesia, the colonial tragedy begun in 16–20 century had encouraged the women participation in anti colonialist movement. Thenceforth, women began their involvement in public sector. There was some female warlord who led the battle against the Dutch colonizers,

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Japan</th>
<th>Indonesia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>192</td>
<td>Empress Jingu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>592–628</td>
<td>Empress Suiko</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>592–628 and 655–661</td>
<td>Empress Kogyaku</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>655</td>
<td>Empress Saimi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>674</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>686–697</td>
<td>Empress Jito</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>707–715</td>
<td>Empress Gemmei</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>715–724</td>
<td>Empress Gensho</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>749–758</td>
<td>Empress Koken</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>764</td>
<td>Empress Shotoku</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>1629–1643</td>
<td>Empress Meisho</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1328–1351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>(1762–1771)</td>
<td>Empress Go Sakuramachi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
such as Malahayati (1585–1604), Nyi Ageng Serang (1752–1828), Martha Christina (1817), Cut Nyak Dien (1850–1908) and Cut Meutia (1870–1910). Although in most of these wars Indonesia could not win but the wars cost a lot and resulted in the Dutch bankruptcy. This bankruptcy made the Dutch changed it strategies and allow some Indonesian upper class, included some Indonesian women, to get education. One of them is Kartini, the first Indonesian feminist life in the beginning of 20 century, who spread the idea that women must get the education. This education fostered a spirit of nationalism and opened the mind that women must participate on Indonesia struggle for independence.

Along with the Indonesian national awakening in 1908, women built women organization as a basis for their participation in public sector. Many women organizations sprang up. Some of them are independent organization which be built by women themself, and some others are the women’s division which affiliated with other organization. These women organizations have a clear platform, vision, mission and programmes.

Most of these women organization programmes are related with education for women. But, some of them brave enough to move on political issues. They dare to show its anti-imperialism and anti-colonialism position. For examples, in 1926, the Indonesian Communist Party (Partai Komunis Indonesia) took up arms against the Dutch. As a result, 4,500 people involved were exiled to Boven Digul, 15 of them were women, and one of the women was Soekaesih. In 1930, a feminist women organization, named “Istri Sedar” (women awarness) was be built, and led by Nona Suwarni Joyoseputro. This organization want to eliminate gender inequality, and believe that it only can be achieve if Indonesia got its independence. Even it was not a formal political party, but its anti colonial standing position was very brave and very politics. These data show that Indonesian women have participated in politics actively, despite in the colonial period.

3.2 Comparing Japanese and Indonesian Cultural Context

1. Japan

Culture has therefore commonly been suspected to be an important determinant of women’s participation in politics. The stereotyped perception for gender roles that has been developed in the minds of people will determinant of women’s participation in politics.

Although Japan and Indonesia are similarly located in the Asian region, and both are influenced by “oriental” cultures, but both have different cultural backgrounds. Japan is more influenced by Confucian culture which more patriarchy and subordinate against women. Indonesia is more influenced by Islam culture which more egalitarian and emancipatory against women.

Confucian begins to influence Japan in 7 th century. The patriarchy character of Confucian can be examined in Jitsugokyo book, which write about the obligations of women as a child, wife and mother. Women are educated to be obedient to men and her family. The most important duty of women is to obey her parents (as a child), to obey her husband (after marriage), to obey her eldest son (after old), and to obey her mother-in-law (after married). (Suryohadioprojo, 1982)

The inferiority of women to men can be seen in the book entitled “Onna Daigaku” (The Great Learning for Women) written by Kaibara Ekken, a Confucian scholar of the fifteenth century. This
book was written for the guidance of the new bride so that she might understand clearly what was expected of her. "A woman must consider her husband’s home her own ... However low and needy her husband's position may be, she must find no fault with him, ..... Once married, she must never leave her husband's house". (Mace, 1959)

In the past, the Japanese wife constantly lived in fear of being divorced by her husband. As in China and Korea, the following “seven reasons” were considered legitimate to warrant a divorce: 1) disobedience to father-in-law or mother-in-law; 2) barrenness; 3) lewdness; 4) jealousy; 5) leprosy or any such foul disease; 6) garrulosity and prattling; 7) stealing. (Clement, 1907) (Rhim, 1978)

During the Meiji restoration period (1868–1911), the influence of Western education expanded so quickly that it raised fears of an identity crisis. So in 1890 the emperor Mutsuhito instructed that Confucius should be made a state ideology and education should be restored to the principles of Confucianism. The ideology of “good wife, wise mother” (ryōsai kenbo) guided women’s role under the emperor system. It defined women’s place at home and emphasized household responsibility. (Usui, Rose, & Kageyama, 2003)

Despite Japan’s massive educational revolution during the Meiji restoration period, but the educational curriculum for women and men was different. The curriculum for women is more aimed for preparing women as household managers. (Hartono)

After the end of World War II there was an attempt to realize gender equality, but this effort faced high resistance from conservative MPs. In 1946 the new Constitution draft was submitted to the Japanese Diet, clearly providing political and social equality between men and women. Especially, Article 24 stated that the family relation should be cultivated based on the individual rights of the members, and essential equality between the sexes. One conservative member of the Diet strongly objected to this draft and said that this draft will destroy the traditional family system. “The Japanese family system and the emperor system are closely related. It root from the mythological age. We thanks to this system that our culture has developed. Our political system is closely related to this family system” (Horimoto, 1999)

2. Indonesia

How does the Indonesian cultural context? Indonesia has its cultural diversity, but the Muslim population is the majority. So, teachings of Islam become the important determinant of women’s participation in politics. Actually, teachings of Islam is more egalitarian. “For God, the grade or the rank of human being is not depended on their gender but on their piety”. Islam teaches that both women and men are obligated to perform “amar ma’ruf nahi munkar” (enjoining what is good and forbidding what is evil) in the public sphere.

Moreover, Islam that developed in Indonesia is different with Islam that developed in Middle East countries. For example, in some Arab countries women have not been allowed to go out and drive a car by themselves; most Indonesian women have been free to drive and go everywhere by themselves. In terms of inheritance, Indonesian women have been able to inherit land and other property (Qibtiyah, 2010)

In some Middle Eastern countries, women are less involved in socio-economic activities. In
most of Middle East countries markets, traders and buyers are predominantly men. In contrast to Indonesian markets, traders and buyers are mostly women. Even in some Indonesian Muslim communities, the role of women in the socio-economic field is very prominent. For example in the traditional batik traders community in the Laweyan village, Solo, Indonesia.

In Laweyan village, there are many women batik (Javanese traditional textile) merchants, called “Mbok Mase”. “Mbok Mase” is responsible for organizing all batik manufacturing and trading process, from designing, raw material purchase, batik drawing, sales, finance, arrangement and payment of its employees. Making Batik requires a high level of patience so that only women are painstaking to do so and can become “Mbok Mase”. “Mbok Mase” is an example of a strong women in Indonesian moslem community. From this description we can conclude that not all of Indonesian moslem community was hegemoned by patriarchy culture. Women have a lot of rooms to express their talents. With their economic power, women have an opportunity to join in political activities, included to be political leaders.

Women in leadership positions is a sensitive issue in most Moslem societies. Even though reality has shown that women can compete with men, some people continue to use ‘religious reasons’ to block women’s advancement to leadership roles and maintain the status quo. (Rohman, 2013). Actually, women in early Islam had shown that a woman could become a leader in Muslim society. For example, Khadija (555–623 AD), the first Muhammad’s first wife, was successfully running her business. (Rohman, 2013)

4. Comparing Japanese and Indonesian Political Contexts

4.1 The Masculin Culture in Political Party

In the male-dominated political culture of Japan, women themselves, as well as political parties and the general public, have typically thought of politics as men’s business. Japanese political party culture is not women friendly. Liberal Democrat Party (LDP) women operate as ‘space invaders’ (Puwar, 2004) within a masculinised space that has been created and managed by men. Labelling the LDP a masculinised space means that apart from being numerically dominated by men, it is also characterised by: normative behaviour for masculinized spaces such as late-night meetings and smoking; normative lifestyles, such as focus on career over family; and normative political styles, such as corrupt dealings, aggression and boys-club networking. Politician in Japan embody the sarariiman model of masculinity, which (Dasgupta, 2003) has identified as having full-time careers as the centre of their lives. The masculinised culture of the LDP excludes women because they are typically less able or willing to devote themselves to paid work. Furthermore, because dominant forms of masculinity are constructed dichotomously against notions of femininity the masculinised culture of the LDP is dependent on women to occupy support roles outside the Diet in the private sphere. The conservative and largest party in Japan, the LDP, has been in power for most of the last 53 years. (Dalton, 2008)

Not only in Japan, Indonesian women face similar problem with masculin culture in political party. The number of women who join political party is low. Although all of people can join political
party, but most of the political parties do not have a clear membership recruitment system. It is become the obstacle for women, since most of women do not familiar with political party recruitment system.

Beside that, many women legislator and political party activists have kinship networks, such as the wife, children, or relatives of the party officials. According The Political Studies Center – University of Indonesia, 77 of 565 member of Indonesian House of Representative have kinship networks.

4.2 The Women Quota System in Indonesia

Indonesian women got the momentum in political reformation period. The fall of Suharto in May 1998, followed by political reform, has provided momentum for women to demand gender equality in politics, included to demand the women’s quota in various public positions, especially DPR, DPRD and political parties. The reform era has opened up opportunities for various societies, included women’s groups, to provide input to Indonesia’s new political system. The Indonesian political reform also provides wider opportunities for the emergence of women’s organizations and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) engaged in gender issues.

Some classic questions related to the issue of women’s participation become public discourse. “What is the role of women in the reform era? Do women already have equal rights and opportunities with men in politics and occupy existing political posts?; Along with the implementation of elections in the reform era, do women have equal representation with the number of female population (50–51%) ?, How to increase women’s political participation and women’s representation?”

The struggle for women quota and combating the masculin culture in Indonesia was very exhausted. At the beginning, women activists got an opportunity to propose articles about women’s quota when the government and the House of Representatives must make election laws and party laws to face the 1999 elections. This first attempt to insert articles about women’s quota in the new political party law was failed. The working committees and special committees of the House of Representative which be established for discussing the bill, had no gender perspective at all.

The issue of women in politics can not be included in the agenda of discussion. In the beginning they got very strong opposition from many groups included from religion leaders and male politicians. The parliament members, included some women who had seat there, have not aware that the women under representative is a problem that needs to be advocated through state policy. It also shows that the idea of women’s quota is not derived from women who had seat in the House of Representative, but derived from the community (women activists).

Finally, the women activist success to insert women quota a in article 65 Law No12/2003 and being corrected in law No. 10/2008 and Law No. 8 Year 2012 about legislative election (on Election of House of Representative, Regional Representative Council, and Local Council). Article 65 : “Every Political Party Election Participants can nominate candidates for the DPR, Provincial DPRD and Regency / City DPRD for each Electoral District ‘with pay attention’ to the representation of women at least 30%.”
This achievement is a result of a very exhausted effort from women quota support groups which consist of women’s NGOs, academics, politician, bureaucrats from Women Empowerment Ministrial and some women who become members of House of Representative.

Eventhough, since the wording is just “with pay attention”, so many political parties didn’t fullfill this provision. They said that this provision is not compulsory, so as if they didn’t fullfill this provision, it didn’t a matter. This experience make the women quota support groups continue to struggle for a better provision. They got another opportunity when Indonesian parliament made a public hearing for Election Law revision.

In Law No 10 Year 2008 on Parliament Election law, there are a progress for the women quota provision. Article 53 state that “The list of prospective candidates as referred to in Article 52 ‘contain’ at least 30% (thirty percent) representation of women. Article 55 state that “In the list of prospective candidates, every 3 (three) candidates, there are at least one (1) women candidate.

So, there is a significant progress on the law on women quota in parliament. At the beginning the wording is “pay attention” (in 2003), and than “contain / should include” (in 2008 and 2012), and there are a semi zipper system “every 3 (three) candidates, there are at least one (1) women candidate” (in 2012). At the implementation level, the electoral commission give a new sanction to the political parties which could not fullfill to nominate at least 30% women candidate. The political parties which could not full fill, could not run in the election in that district.

This sanction got different respons from female and male candidate. Most of female candidates are agree, but most of male candidate didn’t agree. Many political party leaders complained that looking for women candidate is very difficult. Political parties who didn’t agree with this sanction said that there are no statement about the sanction in the election law.

The implementation of this sanction is an extraordinary encourage from Electoral Commission to interpret the word “contain / should include”, stated in article 55 Law No 8 Year 2012 on legislatif election: “The list of prospective candidates as referred to in Article 53 contain at least 30% (thirty percent) representation women”. It is show us that Electoral Commissioner have a very significant role in interpret the election law. Although there are no difference article on women quota in legislatif election law Year 2008 and Year 2012, but the implementation is very different. It show us that gender equality become a stronger norm in Indonesia. (Azizah, 2016)

4.3 Gender Quota Debate in Japan

Despite the persistently low percentage of women in Japanese national and local assemblies, there have been little debates on the gender quota in Japan. Some debate on gender quota was brought up in the national Diet, i.e in the mid 1990s, in 2000, in 2009 and 2012.

The first debate was in the mid 1990s when the Diet discuss about electoral reform. The Prime Minister Hosokawa (LDP) responded to the question on women by saying we needed to consider the introduction of the quota system in order to make it possible for women to actively participate in politics.

The second debate was in the year 2000 when the members in the Research Committee in the Upper House took up the issue of the gender quota in the session on the participation of women in
the policy making process. The Social Democratic Party member, Mie, explicitly stressed the need to introduce the gender quota, citing the recent case of its adoption in South Korea.

To respond these demands, in 2003 the Liberal Democratic Party (LDP) committed to the goal of 30% female representation in management and political positions by 2020. This policy is also for conforming with the international norm to promote women's leadership.

This nonbinding commitment received widespread media attention, and invites pros and cons. Many female Diet members tend to disagree with the gender quota ideas. A senior female LDP member pointed out the gender quota was probably unconstitutional as it would violate the equality before the law, and that it was not desirable as the election was to be based on the free competition.

On debating electoral system reform, another Japanese parties, A New Komeito lawmaker touched on the advantage of the PR for female candidate and the necessity to keep the Proportional Representative (PR) segment of the existing parallel electoral system. A member from the Japan Communist Party also mentioned the importance of the PR as well as the voluntary effort on the part of political parties. But neither of them did not mention the gender quota.

The third debate was in 2010 – 2012, when the LDP was ousted and the DPJ came into power. Two prime ministers of the DPJ, Hatoyama in 2010, and Kan in 2011, responded to the questions from the DPJ Diet member regarding the gender quota. But both simply said women should be able to play important roles and failed to go into any detail as to the possibility or the suitability of the gender quota.

In 2012, the opposition female LDP member, Abe (not to be confused with the current Prime Minister) asked to Katayama (then Minister for Internal Affairs and Communications Katayama) in the session of the committee on the political ethics and public office electoral law in the Lower House, whether he had the knowledge of the gender quota. Answer that question, Katayama said that gender quota is unconstitutional. He questioned the feasibility of the legally binding gender quota, though he acknowledged the necessity of certain measures to increase female Diet member. He told his difficult experiences as governor of Tottori Prefecture, when he attempted to encourage women to run for the elections.

The fourth debate was between Noda and Takaichi, in the LDP general election campaign in December, 2012. In this campaign the LDP pledged its intent to increase the proportion of women in decision making positions to 30%. Both Noda and Takaichi are conservatives, but Noda is a strong advocate of the gender quota, and Takaichi is firmly against it. Noda believes that disadvantages that women have to endure in Japan can only be amended with preferential treatments, while Takaichi is of the opinion that competitions have to be on the equal basis without quotas.

In 2012, Prime Minister Shinzō Abe reemphasized this goal before the lower house election. Yet, in his first cabinet, Abe appointed only two women. Moreover, in the 2013 upper house election, the LDP fielded only 9 women out of 79 candidates, nowhere near the 30% candidate goal (Torres 2013). In September 2014, Abe appointed five new women in his cabinet reshuffle, two of whom were forced to resign a month later due to scandals. Four women currently sit on the cabinet due to one female replacement (Flackler 2014). Despite Abe’s attempts to increase women in his cabinet, most agree that Japan is not on target to meet the 30% benchmark (Gender Equality Bureau 2012).
5. Conclusion

Located in the Asian region that has a very strong patriarchal system, Japanese and Indonesian women face similar difficulties for increasing their representation in parliament (House of Representative). Both have to face the masculin culture in political parties and unfriendly electoral system. Indonesian women got a slightly better result on the House of Representative since they have different cultural backgrounds. Japan is more influenced by Confucian culture which more patriarchy and subordinate against women. Indonesia is more influenced by Islam culture which more egalitarian and emancipatory against women. The teachings and practices of Islam in

| Table 2  Determinant Factors on Women in Politics: Similarities and Differences |
|-------------------------------------------------|------------------|------------------|
| % Women in House of Representative              | 9.5% (45 from 475) | 17.3% (97 from 560 in 2014 election) |
| Legeslated Women Quota                          | No               | Yes              |
| Voluntary Party Quota                           | Yes In 2003, Japan's dominant Liberal Democratic Party (LDP) committed to the goal of 30% female representation in management and political positions by 2020-Non Binding | No |
| Women/Gender Quota Discourse                   | In the mid 1990s when the major electoral reform was discussed. In 2000. In 2009 when the Democratic Party of Japan came into power | 1998: Women quota demand 2003: Women quota in parliament candidacy |
| Political Momentum                              | No               | Yes 1998: Political Reform |
| Group Right                                     | No Politics (election) base on individual right (liberal mindset) | No Politics (election) base on individual right (liberal mindset) |
| Women Movement Pressure on advocating Gender/Women Quota in Parliament | Week | Very Strong The demand on women quota come from the women activist in 1998 |
| Electoral System                                | Single Member District, and Proportional Representative | Multi Member District, The elected candidate is determined by majority vote (most vote) |
| Religion                                        | Confusian Subordinate Women | Islam Conservative: Progressive: More Egalitarian |
| Political Party Culture                         | Masculin         | Masculin         |
| Historical Background                           | Discourage The military aristocracy (shogun-samurai) in the 12–19 century and before the World War II forced women to decrease their involvement in politics | Encourage Women are very actively participating to expel colonizer |
Indonesia are more encourage women to participate actively in society. The colonial tragedy begun in 16 – 20 century had encouraged the women participation in anti colonialist movement. In 1998, Indonesian reformation opened the window of opportunity for women to advocate the women quota law.

Although at first the rule of women quota was weak but then became stronger in the next election legislation. The existence of quota rules has increased the spirit of women to run in elections, as well as to pressure political parties to open space for women in the political party.

On women representative issues, Japanese and Indonesian women find many similarities and differencies, such as describes in table bellow.

Reference


